

Criteria for Reviewing Scholarly Digital Editions



The catalogue of criteria for reviewing scholarly digital editions was established in order to facilitate both reviewers and creators of scholarly digital editions and related projects with a comprehensive list of crucial issues that arise in the context of said projects. We ask reviewers to pay close attention to this catalogue, but we do not require that each and every item mentioned in this catalogue is explicitly raised in the written version of the review. Keep in mind, however, that we do require that reviewers fill out a questionnaire that covers most of the catalogue, so becoming familiar with it before you start to evaluate the project under review is recommended.

German Version

The catalogue was originally written in German by Patrick Sahle et al. Its most recent version can be accessed here.

English Version

An English version (trans. the members of the IDE, with major contributions by Misha Broughton, James Cummings, Franz Fischer, Philipp Steinkrüger, Walter Scholger) of the catalogue is also available and can be accessed here.



Italian Version

An Italian version (trans. Anna Cappellotto with contributions by Gioele Barabucci, Antonella Ambrosio, Vera Schwarz-Ricci and Paolo Monella) of the catalogue is also available and can be accessed here.

Spanish Version

A Spanish version (trans. Susanna Allès Torrent) of the catalogue is also available and can be accessed here.

Criteria for Reviewing Digital Text Collections

Digital text collections are fundamental as a basis for research in the Digital Humanities. So far, questions of quality and sustainability are rarely discussed in academic discourse. Reviews can help to draw more attention to the (often) scholarly work and achievements involved in the creation and edition of digital text collections. They can also contribute to the development of Best Practices for creating, editing and publishing text collections.

To address these issues and to support reviewing of digital text collections, the Criteria for Reviewing Digital Text Collections have been written. The catalogue is written by Ulrike Henny-Krahmer and Frederike Neuber in collaboration with the members of the IDE. Version 1.0 is available here.



Criteria for Reviewing Tools and Environments for Digital Scholarly Editing

Digital scholarly editions are one of the most important research outputs in the Digital Humanities. Their creation today involves, usually, if not always, the employment of certain tools to facilitate the planning and execution of the project. These tools, therefore, have a fundamental role in our daily scholarly practices and in the interactions with our objects of study. Insofar as tools shape scholarly editions, they also shape scholarly editing.

To allow for a structured evaluation of existing tools employed in the process of creating Digital Scholarly editions, the Criteria for Reviewing Tools and Environments for Digital Scholary Editing have been written. The catalogue was produced by Anna-Maria Sichani and Elena Spadini, in collaboration with the members of the IDE. Version 1.0 is available here.