




Resource reviewed	
Title	Petrus Plaoul. Commentarius in libros Sententiarum: Editiones electronicas
Editors 	Jeffrey C. Witt
Bibliographical description of responsible personnel. Please indicate names as “forename surname”.	
URI	http://petrusplaoul.org
Publication Date 	2011ff.
Format should be either yyyy, yyyyff. or yyyy-yyyy, e.g. 2007 or 2007-2013	
Date of last access	03.02.2015

Reviewer	
Surname	Dunning
First Name	Andrew
Organization	Centre for Medieval Studies, University of Toronto
Place	Toronto, Ontario, Canada
Email	andrew.dunning (at) utoronto.ca

Documentation	
Bibliographic description	Is it easily possible to describe the project bibliographically along the schema “responsible editors, publishing/hosting institution, year(s) of publishing”? (cf. Catalogue 1.2) ✔

Contributors	Are the contributors (editors, institutions, associates) of the project fully documented? (cf. Catalogue 1.4)	✓
Contacts	Does the project list contact persons? (cf. Catalogue 1.5)	✓
Selection of materials		
Explanation	Is the selection of materials of the project explicitly documented? (cf. Catalogue 2.1)	✗
Reasonability	Is the selection by and large reasonable? (cf. Catalogue 2.1)	✓
Archiving of the data 	Does the documentation include information about the long term sustainability of the basic data (archiving of the data)? (cf. Catalogue 4.16)	✓
Choose yes if you have reason to believe that the archiving and long term sustainability of the data is cared for (e.g. because the data is part of a platform that cares for these aspects), even if the documentation makes no explicit statement about it.		
Aims	Are the aims and purposes of the project explicitly documented? (cf. Catalogue 3.1)	✓
Methods	Are the methods employed in the project explicitly documented? (cf. Catalogue 3.1)	✗
Data Model	Does the project document which data model (e.g. TEI) has been used and for what reason? (cf. Catalogue 3.7)	✓
Help	Does the project offer help texts concerning the use of the project? (cf. Catalogue 4.15)	✗
Citation	Does the project supply citation guidelines (i.e. how to cite the project or a part of it)? (cf. Catalogue 4.8)	✓

Completion	Does the editon regard itself as a completed project (i.e. not promise further modifications and additions)? (cf. Catalogue 4.16)	✗
Institutional Curation ⓘ Select yes, if there is either an explicit claim that continuous maintenance for the project is provided by some institution or you have strong reason to believe that this is the case, even if it is not explicitly claimed, otherwise select no.	Does the project provide information about institutional support for the curation and sustainability of the project? (cf. Catalogue 4.13)	✓
Contents		
Previous Edition	Has the material been previously edited (in print or digitally)? (cf. Catalogue 2.2)	✗
Materials Used	Does the edition make use of these previous editions? (cf. Catalogue 2.2)	⊘
Introduction	Does the project offer an introduction to the subject-matter (the author(s), the work, its history, the theme, etc.) of the project? (cf. Catalogue 4.15)	✓
Bibliography	Does the project offer a bibliography? (cf. Catalogue 2.3)	✓
Commentary	Does the project offer a scholarly commentary (e.g. notes on unclear passages, interpretation, etc.)? (cf. Catalogue 2.3)	✗
Contexts	Does the project include or link to external resources with contextual material? (cf. Catalogue 2.3)	✓
Images	Does the project offer images of digitised sources? (cf. Catalogue 2.3)	✓

Image quality

Does the project offer images of an acceptable quality?
(cf. [Catalogue 4.6](#))



Transcriptions

Is the text fully transcribed?
(cf. [Catalogue 2.3](#))



Text quality

Does the project offer texts of an acceptable quality (typos, errors, etc.)?
(cf. [Catalogue 4.6](#))



Indices

Does the project feature compilations indices, registers or visualisations that offer alternative ways to access the material?
(cf. [Catalogue 4.5](#))



Documents

Types of documents 

Single manuscript:

a single physical document or a series of documents belonging together, like a multi volume manuscript or a series of notebooks.

Single work:

a single work, e.g. Plato's Laches, which might be transmitted in multiple manuscripts.

Collection of texts:

several abstract texts across the documents of their transmission, e.g Aristotle's Physics and Simplicius' Commentary on Aristotle's Physics.

Collected works:

a collection of several works of one or several authors, e.g. the works of Plato.

Papers:

a collection of personal or family documents or personal papers.

Archival holding:

the collection of a repository.

Charters:

texts documenting a legal fact by using a special form supporting its validity, e.g. the Magna Carta.

Letters:

letters of one or several authors.

Diary:

one or several diaries of one or several authors.

Which kinds of documents are at the basis of the project?
(cf. [Catalogue 1.3](#) and [2.1](#))

Single work

Document era 

Classics:

before 500 CE.

Medieval:

501 CE until 1500 CE.

Early Modern:

1501 CE until 1800 CE.

Modern:

1801 CE until today.

Subject

Presentation

Spin-offs 

App:

any application (for personal computer or mobile devices) apart from browsers with which the project can be accessed.

Mobile:

a browser-version adapted for mobile devices.

PDF:

the project or parts of as PDF files.

other:

other access options apart from HTML-browsers.

What era(s) do the documents belong to?
(cf. [Catalogue 1.3](#) and [2.1](#))

Which perspective(s) do the editors take towards the edited material? How can the edition be classified in general terms?
(cf. [Catalogue 1.3](#))

Does the project offer any spin-offs?
(cf. [Catalogue 4.11](#))

Medieval

Philosophy / Theology

none

Browse by 

Structure:

Select this if the project allows browsing by elements used to structure a text, e.g. chapters, sections, paragraphs, etc.

Documents:

Select this if the project offers to browse by individual source objects, e.g. by the individual letters in a letter-edition, the individual charters in a charter-edition, etc.

Images:

Select this if the project allows browsing by facsimile (e.g. through a gallery).

Search

Simple

Advanced 

Any search that offers more complex search than just a word or a phrase, e.g. boolean operators, wildcards, restricted search, etc.

Wildcard 

Any search that offers to substitute a defined set of possible characters by special characters, e.g. 'king*' searching for 'king', 'kings', 'kingdom', etc.

Index 

Select yes if it is possible to access an index of a search field, e.g. if the search field 'author' is present, a list of all authors the project contains is accessible.

By which categories does the project offer to browse the contents?
(cf. [Catalogue 4.3](#))

Authors, Works, Versions,
Documents, Persons

Does the project offer a simple search?
(cf. [Catalogue 4.4](#))



Does the project offer an advanced search?
(cf. [Catalogue 4.4](#))



Does the search support the use of wildcards?
(cf. [Catalogue 4.4](#))



Does the search offer an index of the searched field?
(cf. [Catalogue 4.4](#))



<p>Suggest functionalities ⓘ Any search that offers possible search as soon as the first characters are typed into the search field.</p>	<p>Does the search offer autocompletion or suggest functionalities? (cf. Catalogue 4.4)</p>	<p>✗</p>
<p>Help text ⓘ Texts that explain how to use the search function, e.g. explanation of wildcard characters, operators, etc.</p>	<p>Does the project offer help texts for the search? (cf. Catalogue 4.4)</p>	<p>✗</p>
<p>Aim</p>	<p>Who is the intended audience of the project? (cf. Catalogue 3.3)</p>	<p>Scholars, Interested public</p>
<p>Audience</p>		

Typology 

Facsimile Edition:

Focuses on the visual layer of texts with additional information for access and understanding; no transcription.

Archive Edition:

Focuses on the width of a work, the documents of its transmission, its context; aims at completeness.

Documentary Edition:

Related to the school of “documentary editing”, focuses on the documents rather than on abstract texts; tries to give truthful representations of the documents with (often: diplomatic) transcription and additional information.

Diplomatic Edition:

Focuses on the text (not the visual layer) of documents, tries to give a transcription as accurate as possible.

Genetic Edition:

Focuses on the genesis of texts, usually on the level of microgenesis (within a document) sometimes on the level of macrogenesis (across documents).

Work Critical Edition:

Focuses on the (potentially: complete) work of an author, aims at completeness on the level of the abstract work (and what needs to be presented to accomplish this).

Method

Which type fits best for the reviewed project?
(cf. [Catalogue 3.3](#) and [5.1](#))

Text Critical Edition

Critical editing 

Transmission examined:

Attempt to establish the transmission of the text, the results of which are traditionally reflected in a Stemma Codicum.

Palaeographic annotations:

Accounts of the palaeographic dimension of a text.

Normalization:

Has the orthography been normalised according to a chosen standard (e.g. 'seyn' to 'sein').

Variants:

Accounts of textual variants, i.e. textual differences between documents transmitting the same text.

Emendation:

Corrections or revisions have been applied to the text.

Commentary notes:

Comments regarding any of the phenomena mentioned before or other textual phenomena (not regarding the content).

Standards

XML

Standardized data model

In how far is the text critically edited?
(cf. [Catalogue 3.6](#))

(cf. [Catalogue 3.7](#))

Is the data encoded in XML?

Is the project employing a standardized data model (e.g. TEI)?

Transmission examined,
Normalization, Variants,
Emendation



Types of text 

Facsimiles:

Any copy of historical documents.

Diplomatic transcription:

Transcription of the document taking account of features like spelling, punctuation, abbreviations, deletions, insertions, alterations, etc.

Edited text:

A reading text as constituted by the editor(s), based on procedures like recensio, examinatio, emendatio, correction, normalization, modernization etc.

Translations:

Any translations into languages different from that of the original text.

Commentaries:

Scholarly commentary on the content of the documents.

Semantic data:

Transformation of the text (e.g. an account book) into a database or representation of its content as RDF or the like.

Technical Accessibility

Which kinds or forms of text are presented?
(cf. [Catalogue 3.5.](#))

Facsimiles, Diplomatic transcription, Edited text, Semantic data

Persistent Identification and Addressing 

DOI:

Digital Object Identifier according to the definition of The International DOI Foundation. The DOIs should be resolvable through <http://doi.org/>.

ARK:

Archival Resource Key according to the definition of the California Digital Library. An ARK URL contains the label: 'ark' after the URL's hostname.

URN:

Uniform Resource Name using the urn: scheme. URNs always start with the label 'urn:'.

PURL.ORG:

Persistent Uniform Resource Locator using the PURL concept and administered by the Online Computer Library Centre.

other service:

Choose this if an external service other than the above options is used.

Persistent URLs:









Choose this if the project promises permanent URLs or uses a local resolving system between URLs and underlying technical addresses but does not use any of the external services mentioned in the options.

none:

Choose this if no persistent identifiers and addressing system are used at all.

Are there persistent identifiers and an addressing system for the edition and/or parts/objects of it and which mechanism is used to that end?
(cf. [Catalogue 4.8](#))

none

Interfaces	Are there technical interfaces like OAI-PMH, REST etc., which allow the reuse of the data of the project in other contexts? (cf. Catalogue 4.9)	none
Open Access  Are the contents of the presentation freely accessible without subscription fee?	Is the edition Open Access?	
Accessibility of the basic data  Basic data: the data from which the HTML or other spin-offs have been produced, e.g. the XML of a specific part of the project. If the basic data is only accessible as a download package containing the entire data, select 'no' here.	Is the basic data (e.g. the XML) of the project accessible for each part of the edition (e.g. for a page)? (cf. Catalogue 4.12)	
Download  Can the basic data be downloaded as a whole via HTTP- or FTP-Link, i.e. not only individual parts like the XML of a specific part of the project.	Can the entire raw data of the project be downloaded (as a whole)? (cf. Catalogue 4.9)	
Reuse	Can you use the data with other tools useful for this kind of content? (cf. Catalogue 4.9)	
Rights		
Declared	Are the rights to (re)use the content declared? (cf. Catalogue 4.13)	

License 

CC0:

Creative Commons license CC0 applied.

CC-BY:

Creative Commons license CC-BY applied.

CC-BY-ND:

Creative Commons license CC-BY-ND applied.

CC-BY-NC:

Creative Commons license CC-BY-NC applied.

CC-BY-SA:

Creative Commons license CC-BY-SA applied.

CC-BY-NC-ND:

Creative Commons license CC-BY-NC-ND applied.

CC-BY-NC-SA:

Creative Commons license CC-BY-NC-SA applied.

PDM:

Work is in the Public Domain.

Personnel

Editors

Under what license are the contents released?
(cf. [Catalogue 4.13](#))

CC-BY-NC-ND

Jeffrey C. Witt